

30 September 2009



John Brumby  
Premier of Victoria  
GPO Box 4912  
Melbourne VIC 3001

**Registered Office**  
55 Johnston Street  
Fitzroy VIC Australia  
**Mail** P O Box 234  
Fitzroy VIC 3065  
**Phone** (03) 9411 1444  
**Fax** (03) 9416 051  
**Web** [www.tuv.org.au](http://www.tuv.org.au)

Dear Premier,

### **Victorian Climate Change Green Paper**

The Tenants Union of Victoria (TUV) welcomes the opportunity to respond to the Victorian Climate Change Green Paper. Our submission will focus specifically on the issues with the most immediate impact on residential tenants, including the residential energy efficiency and energy and water affordability.

The TUV was established in 1975 as an advocacy organisation and specialist community legal centre, providing information and advice to residential tenants, rooming house and caravan park residents across the state. We assist about 18,000 private and public renters in Victoria each year. Our commitment is to improving the status, rights and conditions of all tenants in Victoria.

The TUV broadly endorse the submission of the Victorian Council of Social Service. In particular, we endorse the VCOSS recommendations relating to: the goals, priorities and the role for government to be established in the White Paper; the Climate Change Bill; community resilience; industry transition; the build environment; transport; emergency management; health; energy and water affordability.

We strongly advocate the inclusion of a policy equity criteria in future climate change policies which would include a commitment to ensuring policies do not exacerbate existing economic and social inequalities. We believe a key objective of climate change policy is the need to address the inequitable distribution of costs and risks associated with climate change and mitigation, adaptation and adjustment.

#### **Vulnerability: health and utilities affordability**

The link between housing and health outcomes is well established. Poor quality housing places inhabitants' health at risk. In the context of climate change, Victoria is likely to experience extreme temperatures. The impact of heat related illness and mortality is disproportionately felt by older people, children and those with chronic illness. Given the role the rental sector now plays in Australia's housing system, individuals and households with the markers of

*continued...*

vulnerability are likely to be heavily concentrated in the low cost segment of the private rental market. Poor thermal performance places tenants at risk of illness and mortality in extreme weather.

### **The rental sector context**

Historically viewed as a transitional tenure, the private rental market tenure share continues to increase as home ownership and social housing decline. According to Australian Bureau of Statistics (ABS) data, around 20% of Victorian households reside in the private rental market. In particular, private rental is overwhelmingly the housing tenure of low-income and disadvantaged Victorian households: almost 195,000 households receive Commonwealth Rent Assistance, indicating that they are in receipt of some other form of government financial support, and over 85,000 private renter households earn less than \$500 per week. By comparison, fewer than 62,000 Victorian households reside in public housing.

Unlike many other countries Australia has no large scale institutional investment in residential property either through the social housing sector (which accounts for less than 4% of housing overall) or through private institutions. Investors are small scale (“mums & dads”) who generally have portfolios with one to three properties in a suburb close to their own residence.<sup>1</sup>

Most investors in private rental housing cite long term capital gain as their primary reason for investment.<sup>2</sup> Only 15% of investors are reliant on rental returns as their primary source of income.<sup>3</sup> About two thirds of private rental housing is managed by real estate agents and about one third is directly managed by private landlords.<sup>4</sup>

### **Current market conditions**

The current rental market is typified by historically low vacancy rates and significant annual median rent movements. Key drivers include increasing costs and a substantial supply gap. An overall growth in stock has masked a contraction in the proportion of private rental properties affordable for low income households.

The generally acknowledged equilibrium point in the market is a vacancy rate of 3 per cent of total stock. In Melbourne, the latest data reveals the vacancy rate of 1.5 per cent.<sup>5</sup> Because of increased demand, landlords have even less inducement

---

<sup>1</sup> M. Berry (2000) Investment in Rental Housing in Australia: Small Landlords and Institutional Investment, *Housing Studies* Vol. 15, No. 5.

<sup>2</sup> A. Beer 1999 Housing Investment and the Private Rental Sector in Australia, *Urban Studies*, Vol 36 No 2, pp. 255-269. T. Seelig et al (2009) Understanding what motivates households to become and remain investors in the private rental market, AHURI.

<sup>3</sup> ABS 1998 Rental Investors Survey Australia, cited by Seelig et al (2006) Motivations of investors in the private rental market, Positioning Paper, AHURI.

<sup>4</sup> ABS 2006 Census

<sup>5</sup> Office of Housing Victoria (2009) *Rental Report*.

to make improvements to their properties in order to attract potential tenants. Our experience suggests that the shortage of affordable rental housing has resulted in substandard dwellings enter the market and a growth in marginal forms of housing tenure such as informal rooming houses and long stay caravan parks. Importantly, the likelihood of a very tight rental market in the foreseeable future means tenants are less able to exercise choice.

### **The characteristics of rental dwellings and maintenance**

There is very little current data available on the characteristics of private rental housing. This is a significant shortcoming in housing research. However, data available on investor expenditure in the early 1990s indicated that 65% of landlords spend less than \$1000 per annum on maintenance.<sup>6</sup> Low expenditure on maintenance can be expected to negatively affect the energy efficiency and performance of rental housing in the longer term.

Furthermore, the Master Builders Association estimates the average energy efficiency rating of Victoria's housing stock to be just 2.2 stars. Given Victoria builds fewer than 40,000 new dwellings per year, MBA estimate it will take 40 years to before half Victoria's housing stock achieves the 5 star rating mandated for newly constructed properties.<sup>7</sup>

Subsidies and tax incentives for private landlords to invest in energy efficiency measures are unlikely to address the existing institutional barriers in isolation from other measures. The performance of two key rebate schemes illustrates the take up rate by landlords. Sustainability Victoria has run an insulation rebate scheme for landlords since 2008. In a survey conducted of insulation recipients only 12 per cent of those surveyed were tenant households.<sup>8</sup> The Commonwealth's Low Emission Assistance Plan for Renters displays a similar poor performance with a ratio of one rental property accessing this scheme to every 14 accessing the equivalent scheme for owner occupiers.<sup>9</sup>

### **The legal context**

The law regarding rental housing standards is complex. The construction and thermal efficiency standards of new rental housing are governed by the Victorian Building Regulations and the Building Code of Australia. There are very few requirements on rental property that promote energy efficiency. While the Building Code of Australia (BCA) requires that all homes constructed after 1 July 2005 conform to a 5 star energy rating, the bulk of housing in the private rental market is not newly built, and there are no requirements around energy

---

<sup>6</sup> ABS (1998) Rental Investors Survey

<sup>7</sup> Master Builders Association (2008) Submission to the Inquiry into Victorian Environmental regulations. VCEC November 2008 and De Silver, Radley (2008) Victoria has to keep housing sustainability affordable, *The Age*, 29 August 2008.

<sup>8</sup> K Woods, Working Together Forum, 5 March 2009

<sup>9</sup> K. Keffe, DEWHA Stakeholder Meeting, 13 July 2009.

efficiency applicable. Properties in the rental market constructed before this date are not required to:

- be insulated;
- have an energy efficient heating source;
- be fitted with curtains; or
- to be free of cracks, gaps or other structural defects that directly influences energy efficiency.

Research conducted on behalf of the Government by Ernst and Young indicated that there are no legal requirements for a number of basic dwelling standards such as heating and the provision of hot running water.<sup>10</sup> Housing (Standards of Habitation) Regulations that had governed the standard of all housing, including private rental dwellings, were allowed to lapse in the late 1990's.

The only explicit statutory requirement for rental properties is that any fixture or appliance that uses or supplies water that needs to be replaced must be replaced with a product that has at least an A rating (see *Residential Tenancies Act 1997*, s 69).

The Residential Tenancies Act also limits the extent to which a tenant can make alterations or modifications to the dwelling. In short, the tenant is unable to make any alteration to the rented dwelling without the consent of the landlord and any such alteration must be removed or reinstated at the end of the tenancy agreement.<sup>11</sup> This provision applies whether the alteration is to improve health, safety, access or energy efficiency.

This legislative requirement effectively discourages tenants from making relatively minor and inexpensive modifications to rented properties (such as installing an energy efficient showerhead) that would improve the energy efficiency of their property. Furthermore, tenants are a fairly mobile population group, moving house on average every 18 to 24 months. Even if the making of small, non-structural modifications were permitted by law, this mobility would also discourage tenants from making even small investments in energy efficiency products for their rented homes, as they will gain no long-term benefit from their investment, and face the possibility of having to make the same investment in their new property.

To effect changes in the private rental market, the Victorian Government will have to consider options to directly address the barriers imposed by this split incentive. To improve the energy efficiency of housing, legislative and programmatic responses will have to target landlords to cause them to make alterations to the fixtures and structures of their properties, as tenants have little capacity to make lasting and effective changes.

---

<sup>10</sup> Ernst and Young (2007) Minimum Amenity Standards in Private Rental Accommodation, prepared for Department of Human Services.

<sup>11</sup> RTA s. 64.

## **Behaviour change**

Behavioural change programs can make a significant contribution to reducing household energy consumption; however the effectiveness of behaviour change for renting households is limited by the energy efficiency of the dwelling they inhabit and the fixed appliances provided by the landlord. Low income renters are particularly vulnerable due to their inability to purchase more efficient white goods and the tendency for low rent stock to have poorer energy performance. The impact of behavioural change is further limited by the need for a household to adapt to different dwellings as they churn through rental properties and the social determinants of energy consumption behaviour. For example, wearing a jumper inside during winter is seen as reasonable while going to bed during the day time would be regarded by most Australians as a form of fuel poverty.

## **Barriers to the take up of energy efficiency**

The principal barrier to energy efficiency in rental dwellings is the split incentive. The split incentive arises because the landlord who is responsible for maintenance and upgrade of the premises and fixed appliances outlays the cost of improvements but does not perceive any benefit. Instead, the benefit of improvements passes to the tenant in the form of reduced consumption expenses.

Given the limitations of income, the requirement for the landlords consent and the problem of restoration, and the varying length and uncertainty of tenure, most tenants are unlikely to voluntarily upgrade their rented premises. That does not prevent tenants from making behavioural changes to reduce their energy usage but the results of those changes will be limited by the underlying efficiency of the dwelling.

It is widely acknowledged that split incentives for landlord/tenants is a key barrier to improved energy efficiency within domestic households. We also argue that the landlord-tenant relationship has a multiplier effect on other barriers to improved efficiency.

The multiplier effect on barriers is as follows:

- **Lack of awareness and appreciation of energy efficiency to reduce energy bills** – the split incentive removes any incentive for the landlord to consider this issue. Furthermore, the landlord has no incentive to retrofit or weatherproof a property to protect a tenant against unreasonably high power bills caused by a lack of energy efficiency in the property.
- **Resistance to changing habits and the ‘hassle factor’** – landlords and real estate agents are likely to be far more influenced by the hassle factor given that change is likely to require time and money that may not be recovered

from the tenant, given there is neither incentive or compulsion to take advantage of available schemes.

- **Inadequate information about costs and benefits** – It is not clear that a landlord will see any benefits. Moreover, absentee landlords (landlords who do not reside locally or even in Victoria) may not have access to any relevant information about energy efficiency measures applicable to the property.
- **Appliances are not replaced until they fail** – this problem is more likely to impact on private rental properties because the landlord does not benefit from early replacement and is not inconvenienced by unsatisfactory performance or increased energy bills arising from aging or inefficient appliances.

The TUV believes these factors create an imperative for the state government to acknowledge the special need for targeted action to achieve energy efficiency within the private rental market. The acknowledged vulnerability of tenants provides a further imperative for the Victorian Government to place a high priority for targeted measures.

### **Recommendations**

The TUV recommends the government consider the following initiatives:

- Instituting a legislated minimum standards to ensure rental properties are equipped with insulation, heating and hot water conforming to minimum energy efficiency standards and be furnished with window coverings to provide some level of insulation;
- Ensuring compliance by making it an offense to lease properties not meeting standards;
- Legislative reform to allow basic energy efficiency measures to be installed by tenants without the need for permission of the landlord;
- Legislative reform to provide tenants with appeal rights to VCAT where landlords have unreasonably withheld consent to the installation of energy efficiency measures;
- Requiring all new and existing public and private rental housing have a minimum 5-star energy efficiency rating; and
- Funding a loan-based scheme for the retrofitting of existing housing stock to meet these minimum standards for landlords with no other means to pay for retrofitting.

The TUV believes that climate change will have a disproportionate impact on residential tenants unless the Victorian Government develops a policy response that places a priority on addressing the barriers to upgrading the state's rental housing stock. Further, climate change policy must not favour home owners over renters and high income households over lower income consumers unable to enter into the home ownership market.

We welcome any further opportunity to be consulted on these issues. Should any such opportunities arise, please contact me on 03 9411 1413 or 0417 138 471.

Yours sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'T. Archer', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Toby Archer  
Policy and Liaison Worker  
Tenants Union of Victoria